



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Civil Service Commission Agenda Via Conference - Zoom Monday, December 1, 2025, 10 a.m.

This meeting is being held remotely (Zoom) pursuant to Chapters 113 and 115 of the Codified Ordinances Resolution 22-29.

Join the Zoom webinar as a viewer or listener from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device. Join online a <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/81751681418?pwd=Ysmk2ISoadzosYyiZ5BKB4faBDtN7i.1> ; Password: 805276 ; Description: Civil Service Commission; or join by phone at 833-548-0282 (toll free); Webinar ID: 817 5168 1418 , International numbers available at <https://zoom.us/u/at2uk02hE>

Closed captioning is available but Zoom attendees [must turn on this feature](#) in their Zoom settings.

1. Approval of 9/24/25 Meeting Minutes

Documents:

[092425 - MINUTES.PDF](#)

2. Update on Fire Recruitment

Documents:

[EXHIBIT A.PDF](#)

3. Recommendation to remove the following candidates from the Police Lateral Eligibility List

Documents:

[CSC - RECOMMENDATION TO REMOVE NAMES FROM LATERAL ELIGIBILITY LIST.PDF](#)

4. Certify Police Sergeant Eligibility List

Documents:

[POLICE SERGEANT EXAMINATION REQUEST MEMO.PDF](#)
[EXHIBIT B.PDF](#)

5. Next meeting

To request an accommodation for a person with a disability, call the City's ADA Coordinator at 216-491-1440, or Ohio Relay Service at 711 for TTY users.



SHAKER HEIGHTS

**Civil Service Commission Minutes
City Hall, Conference Room
Via Zoom Meetings
Wednesday, September 24, 2025 at 3:00 P.M.**

Members Present: Ronald Fountain, Chairperson
Patricia Inglis, Commissioner
William McRae, Commissioner
Sandra Middleton, Civil Service Commission Secretary

Others Present: Matthew Carroll, Chief Administrative Officer
Wayne Hudson, Chief of Police
Tim Grafton, Police Commander
Patrick Sweeney, Chief of Fire
Tom Narowitz, Battalion Chief of Fire
Patricia Hill, Human Resources Analyst

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Fountain at 3:03 p.m.

Approval of the April 14, 2025 Meeting Minutes

The April 14, 2025 meeting minutes were approved.

Police Entry-Level Eligibility List

Chief Hudson and Commander Grafton reported that the current police entry-level eligibility list had been exhausted. Only 16 candidates were initially eligible; most were disqualified during polygraph or background checks, and only three hires resulted. The Commission unanimously approved the motion to abolish the existing entry-level list in order to establish a new one.

Police Entry-Level Process

Commander Grafton outlined recruitment efforts, noting that the city lost 39 officers in the past five years and hired 39 replacements. A new union contract with increased wages, a \$10,000 signing bonus (paid over five years), and a \$1,000 officer referral bonus are expected to improve recruiting. The Commission discussed testing vendors. Industrial/Organizational Solutions (IOS) was recommended and approved unanimously as the exam provider. Commissioners emphasized that while written tests meet civil service requirements, true evaluation depends on polygraphs, background checks, and probationary performance. The Commission unanimously approved the motion to allow IOS testing service to continue administering the examination process and move forward with the testing cycle.

Police Sergeant Promotional Process

Director Middleton provided an update on the promotional exam for Police Sergeant. Twelve officers sat for the written test (40% of the overall score), with the top ten advancing to the assessment center scheduled for October 24–25. Three vacancies are anticipated.

Fire Entry-Level Eligibility List

Chief Sweeney reported that the Fire Department's eligibility list, established in March 2024, remains active until March 2026. Six firefighters have been hired from the list, and one retirement is expected at year's end. The Department will refresh the list before requesting a new entry-level exam in 2026. Fire candidates must hold paramedic certification, and many already possess experience when applying. Entry-level hires may bring prior service credit affecting compensation but not seniority.

Diversity Report

Chief Hudson presented an update on Police Department demographics. Current sworn staff includes:

- 39 White officers (58%)
- 20 Black officers (32%)
- 3 Asian officers (3.2%)
- 1 Middle Eastern female officer (1.6%)

Female representation has risen to nine officers. Overall department demographics closely align with citywide population data.

Announcements

- Rotary Safety Forces recognition breakfast scheduled for October 15 at 8:00 a.m. at Fire Station No. 1.
- Additional Civil Service Commission meetings anticipated before year-end to address: certification of the Police Sergeant promotional list, certification of a new police entry-level list, review of Civil Service rules, and planning for future fire entry-level testing.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.

Sandra Middleton, Secretary
Civil Service Commission

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2024 FIREFIGHTER/PARAMEDIC ENTRY-LEVEL ELIGIBILITY LIST
CERTIFIED MARCH 22, 2024

Ranking	Name	Notes
1	Kenneth Pritt	Interviewed 7/2/24
	Kyle Dobies	Conditional offer 7/18/24, Not hired
	Elizabeth Galicki	Hired
	Michael Dobscha	Hired
2	Farah Hawk	Interviewed 7/9/24
	Vanessa Zelle	Hired
	Travis Brett	Withdrew 6/24/24
	Aaron Madden	Hired
	Angelo Giannola	
	Alexander Koltas	Withdrew 5/8/24
	Anthony Joseph Mariola	Withdrew 5/24/24
	Ronald Milam	Withdrew 4/8/24
	Clay Foster	Interviewed 7/8/24
3	Brandon Kilgore	Interviewed 7/9/24
	Joseph Zimmerman	Interviewed 7/10/24
	Patrick Heraghty	Withdrew 4/23/24
	Bobby Godnavec	Withdrew 4/11/24
4	Victoria Carafelli	Interviewed 7/12/24
	Alexander Katz	Interviewed 7/10/24
	Nicholas Liberatore	Interviewed 7/9/24
	Tyler Simler	Interviewed 7/15/24

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2024 FIREFIGHTER/PARAMEDIC ENTRY-LEVEL ELIGIBILITY LIST
CERTIFIED MARCH 22, 2024

Ranking	Name	Notes
	Peter Brown	Hired
	Cullen Robert O'Connor	Currently completing supp app as of 5/8
	Angela Gowan	Hired
5	Daniel McCallister	
	Steven Yavorski	
	Eric Harb	
6	Drake Force	
	Jonathan Dotson	
7	William Maier	
	Justin Lovell	
8	Brandon Brown	
	David Stern	
	Matthew Paul Waszkiewicz	
	Benjamin Wurster	
9	Jeffrey Byers	
	Joseph Belavich	
	Collin Kalina	
	Kathryn O'Malley	
	Luke Rodak	
	Donovan Ferguson	
	David Bianchini	
	Dennis Page	

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2024 FIREFIGHTER/PARAMEDIC ENTRY-LEVEL ELIGIBILITY LIST
CERTIFIED MARCH 22, 2024

Ranking	Name	Notes
10	Max Seipel	
11	Shannon Contreras	
12	Matthew James Ferris	
13	Alex Kensinger	
14	Kyle Pryor	
15	Maxwell Rapkin	
	Bridgette Karr	
	Ian R Shirey	
	Bradley Polash	
16	Jeffrey stanczyk	
	Mark Balanda	
19	Madeline Womack	
18	Tyler Harris	
19	Makyle Grant	
	Megan Linsky	
20	Shannon Valerio	



Memorandum

To: Civil Service Commission

From: Sandra J. Middleton, Human Resources Director
Civil Service Commission Secretary

cc: Mayor David E. Weiss
Chief Administrative Officer Matt Carroll

Date: December 1, 2025

Re: Recommendation to remove candidates from the Police Lateral eligibility list

Section 6.3 of the Civil Service Rules states, “If at any time after the creation of an eligible list, the Commission has reason to believe that any person whose name appears on such list is disqualified for appointment because of incapacity developed after his or her examination, because of false statements made in the application or for other just and reasonable cause, said person shall be notified and allowed to be heard. If said person shall fail to appear for such hearing, or it is established at such hearing that said eligible is disqualified or incapacitated for appointment, his name shall be removed from the eligibility list.”

The City is requesting the removal of four candidates from the Police Lateral Eligibility List for reasons deemed just and reasonable. Each candidate was notified via email of their right to appear before the Civil Service Commission. The following individuals are recommended for removal from the list due to their failure to respond and complete the required steps in the pre-hire process.

- ❖ Isabella Morales
- ❖ Keilan Beachum
- ❖ Taeveon Stewart
- ❖ Brandon Momirov

It is requested that the Civil Service Commission vote to remove the above four names from the police lateral eligibility list to allow the City to add additional names to the certified top 20.



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Memorandum

To: Members of the Civil Service Commission
From: Sandra Middleton, Director of Human Resources
cc: Mayor David E. Weiss
Chief Administrative Officer Matt Carroll
Date: December 1, 2025
Re: Sergeant Eligibility List Certification

The Civil Service Commission approved the Police Sergeant Promotional Process at its April 14, 2025 meeting. At that time, the Commission authorized the use of Clancy and Associates to conduct the written examination and the Ohio Association of Chiefs of Police (OACP) to administer the assessment center. Subsequently, Clancy and Associates informed the City that they were unable to provide a custom examination. As a result, the City contracted with Ryan-Ramsey HR Solutions, LLC to develop, administer, and grade the written examination.

The City notified the 35 eligible patrol officers/detectives of the written examination date. Fourteen applications were received by the deadline. The written examination was held on September 3, with 12 applicants present for testing. No protests were filed during the required 14-day protest period. Scores ranged from 78% to 56%. Individual score notifications were provided to all test-takers, and the top 10 candidates advanced to the assessment center.

The Assessment Center was conducted on Friday, October 10, and Saturday, October 11. Five candidates were scheduled each day. One candidate withdrew due to a personal matter. The assessment center was coordinated by a retired Police Chief from Mentor, Ohio, and the assessors were the current Police Chiefs of Mentor, Ohio, and Bexley, Ohio.

The assessment center consisted of three equally weighted exercises:

- Role Play
- Oral Presentation
- Written Exercise

Candidates were evaluated on eight dimensions:

1. Oral Communication
2. Written Communication
3. Interpersonal Insight
4. Problem Analysis
5. Judgment

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS | *Human Resources*

3400 Lee Road Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120 P 216.491.1427 F 216.491.1487 Ohio Relay Service 711

shakeronline.com **www.shaker.life**

6. Decisiveness
7. Planning and Organizing
8. Delegation and Control

Assessment center scores ranged from 88.89% to 70.93%. These scores, along with written examination scores and final composite scores, are included in Exhibit B. Candidates will receive their final scores following certification of the eligibility list. The OACP has also provided detailed individualized reports outlining performance by exercise and dimension; these will be distributed to each candidate.

The Police Sergeant Eligibility List consists of 10 candidates: 9 males and 1 female. Of the 9 candidates, 4 identify as minorities. The assessment center represents 60% of the final score for each candidate and the written examination represents 40%.

It is recommended that the Civil Service Commission certify the Police Sergeant Eligibility List.

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS, OH
2025 POLICE SERGEANT EXAMINATION FINAL RESULTS

Overall Ranking	ASSESSMENT CTR (60%)				WRITTEN EXAM (40%)				TOTAL SCORE
	Raw Score	Ranking	%	Coverted Score	Raw Score	Ranking	%	Converted Score	
1	477.0	3	88.33%	53.00	78	1	78.00%	31.20	84.20
2	478.0	2	88.52%	53.11	74	2	74.00%	29.60	82.71
3	480.0	1	88.89%	53.33	73	3	73.00%	29.20	82.53
4	458.0	5	84.81%	50.89	71	4	71.00%	28.40	79.29
5	460.0	4	85.19%	51.11	66	7 TIE	66.00%	26.40	77.51
6	412.0	7	76.30%	45.78	69	6	69.00%	27.60	73.38
7	440.0	6	81.48%	48.89	61	9	61.00%	24.40	73.29
8	383.0	9	70.93%	42.56	70	5	70.00%	28.00	70.56
9	387.0	8	71.67%	43.00	66	7 TIE	66.00%	26.40	69.40
10	0.0	-	0.00%	0.00	64	8	64.00%	25.60	25.60