



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Civil Service Commission Agenda Via Conference - Zoom Wednesday, September 24, 2025, 3pm

This meeting is being held remotely (Zoom) pursuant to Chapters 113 and 115 of the Codified Ordinances Resolution 22-29.

Join the Zoom webinar as a viewer or listener from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device. Join online at <https://us06web.zoom.us/j/82618970368?pwd=sdDTeggaUKSP7eWFs0lcCckEirBUif.1&from=addon>; Password: 6DDGgA; Description: Civil Service Commission; or join by phone at 833-548-0282 (toll free); Webinar ID: 826 1897 0368, International numbers available at <https://zoom.us/j/82618970368>

Closed captioning is available but Zoom attendees [must turn on this feature](#) in their Zoom settings.

1. Approval of the April 14, 2025 Minutes

Documents:

[CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES 4-14-25.PDF](#)

2. Recommendation to Abolish Police Entry - Level Eligibility List Memo

Documents:

[RECOMMENDATION TO ABOLISH POLICE ENTRY LEVEL ELIGIBILITY LIST MEMO.PDF](#)
[ENTRY LEVEL ELIGIBILITY LIST - EXHIBIT A.PDF](#)

3. Overview and Discussion of Police Entry Level Process

Documents:

[POLICE ENTRY-LEVEL EXAMINATION REQUEST MEMO.PDF](#)
[2024 AITDATA COMP - EXHIBIT B.PDF](#)

4. Recommendation and Approval of Testing Company for Police Entry-Level Process

Documents:

[EXAM COST COMPARISON - EXHIBIT C.PDF](#)

5. Update on Police Sergeant Promotional Process

6. Update on Fire Entry-Level Process

To request an accommodation for a person with a disability, call the City's ADA Coordinator at 216-491-1440, or Ohio Relay Service at 711 for TTY users.



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Civil Service Commission Minutes
Via Zoom Webinar
Monday, April 14, 2025 at 1:00 p.m.

Members Present: Ron Fountain, Chairperson
Patricia Inglis, Commissioner
Lee Trotter, Commissioner
Sandra Middleton, Civil Service Commission Secretary

Others Present: Jeri Chaikin, CAO
William Gruber, Law Director
Wayne Hudson, Chief of Police
Patrick Sweeney, Chief of Fire
John Cole, Police Commander
Jennifer Coe, HR Analyst

Chairperson Ron Fountain called the meeting to order at 1:14 p.m., delayed due to technology issues.

Approval of Meeting Minutes

The minutes of the September 10, 2024 meeting were unanimously approved.

Discussion of the removal of candidates from the police lateral eligibility list

HR Director Middleton suggested the removal of three candidates from the list due to failure to complete the necessary steps for consideration.

Motion to remove passed.

The Commission next considered the promotional process for the rank of Police Sergeant.

Two vacancies currently exist in the sergeant ranks, and the prior eligibility list expired on December 16, 2024. Staff reported that thirty officers are eligible under the civil service rules, with a few more possibly reaching eligibility by mid-2025.

For the written examination, staff recommended using Clancy & Associates. The Commission was advised that the exam will be fully customized, drawing only from Shaker Heights Police Department policies and procedures rather than a mix of internal materials and outside reading lists as in 2022. After discussion, the Commission voted unanimously to approve Clancy & Associates for the written exam.

The second component of the process will be an assessment center, designed to measure leadership, problem-solving, presentation, and personnel management skills. The International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) conducted the 2022 assessment center and was again



SHAKER HEIGHTS

recommended. Candidates will receive written feedback on their performance as in the previous cycle.

The Commission unanimously approved the recommendation to contract with IACP.

Weights for the two components were then discussed.

As in past years, staff recommended assigning 40 percent of the overall score to the written examination and 60 percent to the assessment center.

This weighting was approved unanimously.

The Commission also approved limiting participation in the assessment center to the top ten candidates from the written examination, citing feasibility, costs, and the number of expected promotions.

The Fire Department reported that the current lieutenant eligibility list will expire within days, and a new process will be scheduled. In addition, entry-level firefighter testing will be needed toward the end of 2025 due to anticipated retirements.

Chief Hudson provided an update on the Police Department's continuous lateral hiring process.

He noted that there are current candidates in background checks and several recruits completing academies this spring. The Commission considered a request to remove seven candidates from the police lateral eligibility list due to non-responsiveness.

The motion was unanimously approved, allowing staff to move further down the list.

A diversity update was presented for the Police Department.

The current sworn staff includes 38 Caucasian males, 15 African Americans, two Asian officers, and one Egyptian officer. Thirteen percent of the force are women, and 31.7 percent are African American, which compares favorably to the city's population of 36 percent. Female representation has also grown from four in 2013 to eight currently.

The Commission recognized Commissioner Lee Trotter for his service since 2013.

Chiefs and fellow commissioners reflected on his leadership in modernizing civil service rules, including adoption of the continuous lateral process, expanding eligibility lists to the top 20, adding exam credits for military and college service, and removing barriers such as application fees. Chief Hudson presented him with a challenge coin in recognition. Several speakers noted his balanced judgment, commitment to fairness, and lasting contributions to Shaker Heights public safety.



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Under other business, the Chair requested that draft minutes be circulated within two weeks of each meeting to aid commissioners' review while discussions remain fresh. The next meeting will be scheduled through a Doodle poll.

Chairperson Ron Fountain adjourned the meeting at 1:49 p.m.

Sandra Middleton, Secretary
Civil Service Commission



Memorandum

To: Civil Service Commission

From: Sandra J. Middleton, Human Resources Director
Civil Service Commission Secretary

cc: Mayor David E. Weiss
Chief Administrative Officer Matt Carroll

Date: September 19, 2025

Re: Recommendation to Abolish Police Entry Level Eligibility List

On August 28, 2024, the Civil Service Commission certified a Police Entry Level Eligibility List containing sixteen (16) candidate names. Since that time, four (4) candidates have withdrawn from the process, and the City has hired three (3) candidates from the list (see Exhibit A).

Per Section 6.1 – Eligible Lists, Duration, of the Civil Service Rules:

“The Commission shall maintain or will establish a list of eligible in case class in the classified service for which competitive examinations are given. Each such list shall remain in force for six (6) months from the date of its promulgation unless a new examination is held sooner; each list shall automatically renew every six months for a total of up to two years in force, unless the Commission takes action to the contrary.”

The City has carefully reviewed all remaining candidates on the current Police Entry Level Eligibility List and has determined that none are viable candidates for appointment to the Shaker Heights Police Department.

Accordingly, the City recommends that the Civil Service Commission take formal action to abolish the current Police Entry Level Eligibility List. This will allow the City to proceed with initiating a new recruiting and testing cycle for entry-level police officers.

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2024
POLICE ENTRY LEVEL
ELIGIBILTY LIST CERTIFIED AUGUST 28, 2024

Ranking	Last Name	First Name	Notes
1	HAGWOOD	KEVEION	Hired 6/16/25
2	ZUZEK	JACOB	Withdrew
3	LUZAR	LINCOLN	
4	HIGGINBOTHAN	NICHOLAS	Hired 6/16/25
5	SCOTT	CAYDEN	Withdrew
6	GORDON	ANNIYA	
7	WOOD	CARA	Withdrew
8	ABDERRAZZAQ	ABDELKAREM	
9	STEWART	TAEVEON	
10	RAGGHianti	ESTIVEN	
11	WALKER	THOMAS	
12	MEAD	JEFFREY	Withdrew
13	ROBINSON	TAVON	
14	WILSON	KHALIL	
15	WARREN	TYLER	
16	CALHOUN	TAYLOR	Hired 1/6/25
Updated 9/19/25			



Memorandum

To: Members of the Civil Service Commission

From: Sandra Middleton, Director of Human Resources

cc: Mayor David E. Weiss
Chief Administrative Officer Matt Carroll

Date: September 19, 2025

Re: Police entry-level examination request

The last police entry-level examination was held on August 17, 2024. The passing grade was set at 67% by the Civil Service Commission. The eligibility list was certified on August 28, 2024, and included sixteen names. Three candidates have since been hired from this list, consisting of one White male, one Black male, and one Black female. A demographic analysis of the applicants is provided in Exhibit B.

The City currently has a lateral-entry eligibility list that was established in 2023 as a continuous list. Currently, before any action taken by the Civil Service Commission, 29 names appear on the lateral eligibility list. This list will continue simultaneously with the entry-level eligibility list. This gives the Police Department the flexibility to fill vacancies with both experience and recent graduates from the police academy. As a result, we will strengthen the diversity of experience on each platoon. The hiring process is virtually the same with lateral and entry-level. The main difference is the minimum requirements to apply and the type of test.

	Continuous Lateral Entry	Entry-Level
Type of Test	Non-competitive	Competitive
Police Academy	Must have	Will send
Physical Agility	Not required	Required
Testing Ranking	By order of application received	By test score
Experience Required	Police Academy	None
Min. Requirements	Same	Same
Pradco Law Enforcement Index	✓	✓
Polygraph	✓	✓
Interviews	✓	✓
Physical	✓	✓
Psychological	✓	✓

Chief Hudson states that there are 6 vacancies in the department. Although past test cycles have been successful in attracting candidates, vacancies have remained flat over the last five years. As shown in chart below, there were thirty-nine separations between 2020 and 2025, including twenty-six resignations or discharges and thirteen retirements. During the same five-year period, thirty-nine

offices were hired. Despite this balance, turnover and retirements have kept overall staffing levels steady rather than reducing vacancies.

Summary of Separations By Year

Year	Resignations/Discharge	Retirement	Total
2025	2	1	3
2024	5	4	9
2023	6	3	9
2022	4	4	8
2021	5	1	6
2020	4	0	4
5 YEAR TOTAL	26	13	39

Summary of Hires By Year

Year	Number of New Hires
2025	3
2024	12
2023	9
2022	0
2021	9
2020	6
5 Year total	39

In preparation for a new examination, the City plans to launch a recruiting campaign immediately. This campaign will utilize the newly created catalog of print materials along with short video sound bites, similar to those used by the Fire Department, featuring current officers who will share why they chose Shaker Heights and what they value most about serving in the Department. Special attention will be given to intentionally recruiting people of color and women in order to broaden diversity within the applicant pool. The tentative collective bargaining agreement between the City and the Fraternal Order of Police for the Patrol Officers bargaining unit, covering years 2025 through 2027, has been ratified by the union and will be presented to Council for approval on September 29, 2025. If approved, the agreement will provide higher wages and enhanced benefits, which will be highlighted in the City's recruiting materials. These improvements are expected to make Shaker Heights highly competitive with other communities actively recruiting entry-level officers.

The City anticipates holding the next entry-level examination in November 2025, with the first hires to begin training in the police academy in early 2026. The eligibility list resulting from this examination will remain active for two years from the date of certification, unless abolished by the Civil Service Commission before that time. The City is recommending the use of the Industrial Organization Solutions written examination, which was used successfully in 2024, along with a study guide to help applicants prepare. Further detail on this recommendation is included in Exhibit D.

**CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2024
POLICE ENTRY-LEVEL RECRUITMENT**

Applications distributed (apps available online): **N/A**
 Applications returned: (by August 4): **23**
 Number who took exam : **16**
 Number who passed written test at 67% passing point: **14**
 Number who failed written test at 67% passing point: **0**

RACE & GENDER	APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED		# TAKING WRITTEN EXAM		# PASSING WRITTEN EXAM			# FAILING WRITTEN EXAM			# NOT APPEARING FOR EXAM		
	#	%	#	%	#	PASSING RATE	% OF TOTAL	#	FAILING RATE	% OF TOTAL	#	NO-SHOW RATE	% OF TOTAL
White Males	10	43.5%	8	50.0%	8	100.0%	50.0%	0	0.0%	0%	2	20.0%	28.6%
White Females	2	8.7%	1	6.3%	1	100%	6.3%	0	0%	0%	1	50%	0.0%
Af-Am Males	7	30.4%	4	25.0%	4	100%	25.0%	0	0%	0%	3	43%	0.0%
Af-Am Females	3	13.0%	2	12.5%	2	100%	12.5%	0	0.0%	0%	1	33.3%	0.0%
Asian\ Pacific Island Males	1	4.3%	1	6.3%	1	0.0%	6.3%	0	0%	0%	0	0.0%	0.0%
Asian\Pacific Island Females	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0.0%	0	0%	0%	0	0.0%	0.0%
Hispanic Males	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0.0%	0	0%	0%	0	0.0%	0.0%
Hispanic Females	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0.0%	0	0%	0%	0	0.0%	0.0%
Other\Bi-Racial Males	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0.0%	0	0.0%	0%	0	0.0%	0.0%
Other\Bi-Racial Females	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0	0.0%	0.0%	0	0%	0%	0	0.0%	0.0%
TOTAL	23	100%	16	100%	16	100.00%	100%	0	0.00%	0%	7	30.43%	29%

AITDATA : 8/26/24

Note: 3 candidates referred to lateral process on 8/17

**CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2025 POLICE ENTRY-LEVEL EXAM COST COMPARISONS
BASED ON PURCHASING 100 EXAMS**

AGENCY	Type of Test	STUDY GUIDE COST	EXAM COST	SCORING SERVICE	SHIPPING	TOTAL (For one process)
Industrial Organization Solutions Chicago, Illinois	Written, Standard	\$10 per SG (if candidate purchases) \$6 if city buys SG (must buy 20)	\$25.00 per exam	Free	\$15 via fed	\$3,115.00
Morris And Mcdaniel Entry Level Police Exams	Written, Standard	\$10 per guide	\$25.00 per exam	NA		\$4,000.00
			\$500.00 Admin. Fee			
Cuyahoga Community College Western Campus	Written, Standard portable	N/A	N/A			\$6,400.00
			\$60.00 per candidate \$400.00 Admin. Fee			
B-Pad Group, Inc.	Video , Internet link	N/A	\$60.00 per candidate \$900.00 Annual Fee		N/A	\$6,900.00

EXHIBIT C